

ADI Investigation Report Peer Review Guide-TGB version

Report by \_\_\_\_\_

Reviewed by \_\_\_\_\_ Reviewed by \_\_\_\_\_ Reviewed by \_\_\_\_\_

<p><b>YOU MUST ADDRESS THE FOLLOWING WORDS AND CONCEPTS IN YOUR INTRODUCTION:</b></p> <p>Type I and Type II errors, statistically signification, Chi square value, degrees of freedom, p-value, Trivers-Willard hypothesis</p>	<p><b>Section 1: Introduction and Guiding Question</b></p>		<p><b>Reviewer Rating</b></p>			
	<p>Is there enough background information and is it accurate?</p>		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	
	<p>Is the guiding question explicit and did the author <b>EXPLAIN HOW</b> the question is related to the background information?</p>		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	
<p>Reviewers: <b>EXPLAIN HOW</b> the author could improve this part of his or her report.</p>		<p>Author: What revisions did you make in your report?</p>				
<p><b>Section 2: Method</b></p>				<p><b>Reviewer Rating</b></p>		
<p>Did the author describe the procedures and <b>EXPLAIN WHY</b> the procedures were used?</p>				<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
<p>Did the author describe what data were collected and <b>EXPLAIN WHY</b> the data were collected?</p>				<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
<p>Reviewers: <b>EXPLAIN HOW</b> the author could improve this part of his or her report.</p>		<p>Author: What revisions did you make in your report?</p>				

Section 3: The Argument		Reviewer Rating		
Did the author make a claim consistent with the evidence that answers the guiding question?		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
Quality of Evidence	Did the author describe how he/she analyzed the data and <b>EXPLAIN WHY</b> the analysis helped him/her answer the guiding question?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
	Is the analysis of the data appropriate and free from errors?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
	Is the author's interpretation of the analysis valid?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
	<b>MANDATORY DATA: Chi square statistic, p-value</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
Presentation of Evidence	Are tables and graphs correctly formatted, labeled, and are metric units used?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
	Are specific values from tables and graphs referenced in the body of the text?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
Justification of Evidence	Did the author state <b>WHAT</b> scientific concept is being defended?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
	Did the author <b>DESCRIBE</b> the data from their analysis used as evidence in support of the scientific concept?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
	Did the author <b>EXPLAIN HOW</b> the evidence supports the underlying scientific concept?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
Did the author <b>EXPLAIN HOW</b> his or her claim agrees with the claims made by other groups and <b>PROVIDE REASONS</b> for disagreements?		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
Reviewers: <b>EXPLAIN HOW</b> the author could improve this part of his or her report.		Author: What revisions did you make in your report?		
<b>Mechanics</b>		<b>Reviewer Rating</b>		
<b>Organization:</b> Is each section easy to follow? Do paragraphs include multiple sentences: Do paragraphs begin with a topic sentence?		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
<b>Grammar:</b> Are the sentences complete? Is there proper subject-verb agreement in each sentence? Are there run-on sentences?		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
<b>Conventions:</b> Did the author use appropriate spelling, punctuation, paragraphing and capitalization:		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
<b>Word Choice:</b> Did the author use the appropriate words (e.g., there vs. their, to vs. too, than vs. then, etc.)?		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
<b>Fluency:</b> Does the paper as a whole flow well? Do the sections follow each other to give a complete idea of the lab?		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes